Queen's UNIVERSITY
DEPARTMENT OF
MECHANICAL ENGINEERING
McLaughlin Hall, Stuart Street
Queen's University
Kingston, Ontario, Canada K7L 3N6
Tel 613 533-2575
Fax 613 533-6489
http://conn.me.queensu.ca/mecheng.htm

April 12, 2005

Dr. Kerry Rowe, Vice-Principal (Research)
Richardson Hall,
Queen's University

Dear Dr. Rowe,

**Re: Further Allegation of Misconduct in Academic Research-
Papers published by P. Zhu and R.W. Smith**

I am writing this letter in accordance with Article 17 of the Collective Agreement. I am referring to the paper published by P. Zhu and R.W. Smith which is published in Advanced Materials Research, Vol. 4-5 (1997) pp. 439-444 (enclosed). This paper is almost entirely copied from another paper which was published in Materials Science Forum (Vols. 215-216 (1996) pp.503-510) (enclosed). The authors have intentionally made only small changes in the title and in the abstract of the paper to mislead and to give the impression that the two papers are different.

A more troublesome case is the paper published in Materials Science Forum in 1996. This paper is in fact not original and has been copied from another paper which was published 4 years earlier! (See the paper by P. Zhu and R.W. Smith in "Concurrent Engineering Approach to Materials processing ", Ed. Dwivedi SN et al. (1992), pp. 217- 229 (enclosed)). The plagiarized parts are highlighted. It is seen that all results and almost all paragraphs are copied from this earlier publication:

Fig. 1 is copied from Fig. 3,
Fig. 2(a) is copied from Fig.8,
Fig. 2(b) is copied from Fig.7,
Fig. 3(a) is copied from Fig. 9,
Fig. 3(b) is copied from Fig. 10, and
Fig.4 is copied from Fig. 12.

The evidence that scientific misconduct occurred is compelling. The authors have purposely changed the symbols in the figures to mislead and to give the impression that the results are new. The fact that the authors have intentionally eliminated the earlier publication from the list of references compounds the problem.

I thought I should bring this to your attention.

Sincerely,

M.Shirkhanzadeh

Associate Professor
Department of Materials and Mechanical Engineering

Enc.