



VICE-PRINCIPAL (RESEARCH)

Mackintosh-Corry Hall, Room E407  
Queen's University  
Kingston, Ontario, Canada K7L 3N6  
Tel 613 533-6933  
Fax 613 533-6934

22 December 2005

Dr. Mortenza Shirkhazadeh  
Mechanical and Materials Engineering  
Queen's University

Dear Dr. Shirkhazadeh:

Re: Allegations regarding Dr. Reginald Smith

Further to my letters of this summer outlining the University's process in this matter, I am writing to apprise you of the final determination regarding the complaints lodged during the period of December 2004 and 30 September 2005.

In December of 2004 we secured the consent of a senior member of the academic staff to act as an internal reviewer to consider the original file.

Based on the materials provided to the University at that time, conversations with the respondent and materials subsequently received at intervals, the preliminary assessment of our internal reviewer was that the matter warranted a more detailed review and he recommended the appointment of an expert reviewer in the field to assess content issues.

The University selected an arms length expert in materials science acceptable to Dr. Smith to assess accusations regarding data manipulation. In addition, the University, with the approval of Dr. Smith, selected Dr. William McLatchie to receive all of the materials, including responses from the original assessor, the external expert and Dr. Smith and render a final opinion on the file.

Dr. McLatchie's assessment of the voluminous materials and responses is as follows:

- i) There is no evidence of data falsification
- ii) There is no evidence of plagiarism
- iii) Copyright agreements with publishers may not have been observed

Dr. Smith has recognized the seriousness of the findings regarding the re-use of materials and has implemented policies in his research group to prevent any further issues arising with new work.

*think Research*  
*think Queen's*

Page 1 of 2

The University has taken this matter with the utmost seriousness. We view the matter of the appropriate attribution of scientific papers, use of data, and re-use of scientific materials to be at the cornerstone of academic integrity.

As per our memorandum of understanding with the granting councils, the complete findings will be communicated to NSERC.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "R. Rowe".

R. Kerry Rowe  
Vice-Principal (Research)

cc: Dr. Karen Hitchcock, Principal and Vice- Chancellor