



DEPARTMENT OF  
MECHANICAL ENGINEERING

McLaughlin Hall, Stuart Street  
Queen's University  
Kingston, Ontario, Canada K7L 3N6  
Tel 613 533-2575  
Fax 613 533-6489  
<http://conn.me.queensu.ca/mecheng.htm>

March 22, 2005

Dr. Kerry Rowe, Vice-Principal (Research)  
Richardson Hall,  
Queen's University

Dear Dr. Rowe,

**Re: Allegation of Misconduct in Academic Research-  
Paper published by Huang et al, J. Appl. Phys., 96 (2004) 6213-6219**

I am writing this letter to provide additional information regarding the paper by Haung et al., J. Appl. Phys., 96 (2004) 6213-6219. A copy of this paper is enclosed.

The research findings presented in Figure 7 in this paper appear to be fabricated. The authors claim that the radial temperatures in Fig.7 were calculated (not measured). The authors give the impression that the graphs in Figure 7 have been plotted using the data presented in Fig.5 and 6. Attached is a copy of one of the graphs in Fig.7 that has been magnified. It can be seen that there is a noticeable bump on the right side of the graph. This graph appears to be hand drawn with no real data. Given the symmetrical shape of the sample used (cylinder, 1.5 mm diameter), it is difficult to understand why real calculations should result in an unsymmetrical graph. It appears that the authors have made up the results to compensate for the lack of real data.

The temperature profile shown in Figure 6 also appears to be fabricated. It is noted that the graph is hand drawn without real data similar to graphs presented in Fig. 1. The graph in Fig. 6 shows that during the diffusion experiments the temperature in the middle of the sample ( $x = 20$  mm) is about 200 degrees higher than the temperature at each end of the sample! This is unrealistic and clearly contradicts the data shown in Fig. 5. In fact, given the significant temperature variations claimed in Figures 5 and 6, it is hard to believe that the experiments were done under isothermal conditions. It is difficult to understand how the values of the diffusion coefficient (D) (Tables I-III) at fixed temperatures could be determined.

In addition to fabrication of results, this paper contains significant materials plagiarized from the work of Jean-Pierre Praizey (Int. J. Heat and Mass Transfer, Vol. 32, No.12, P. 2385-2401, 1988). The overall integrity of the paper is questionable.

Yours Sincerely,

M.Shirkhanzadeh  
Associate Professor  
Department of Mechanical Engineering

Enc.



